

DEMSTAR –Kyrgyzstan - Ministry

**Questionnaire for ministers, deputies (or other top
level officials) in ministries of Kyrgyzstan**

(final version)

Questions about policy-initiation and formulation

The bureaucracy

1. Does the following description fit the role of your ministry?

This indicator tries to capture the strength of the particular ministry in terms of deciding its own policy.

- | | Agree | Disagree |
|---|--------------------------|--------------------------|
| (1) The ministry itself initiates political proposals | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |

If disagree: Who formulates policies?

- | | |
|--|--------------------------|
| (1) The President / President's office | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| (2) The Prime Minister / Prime Minister's office | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| (3) The Cabinet of ministers | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| (4) Political Parties | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| (5) Interest organizations | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| (6) International organizations | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| (7) Other – please specify | <input type="checkbox"/> |

2. How would you characterize the legislation initiated by your ministry?

- | | |
|---|--------------------------|
| (1) Mostly general and open statements/frameworks with wide margins for bureaucratic discretion | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| (2) More general and open statements/frameworks than precise formulations | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| (3) More precise formulations than general open statements/frameworks | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| (4) Mostly precise formulations on individual rights and obligations | <input type="checkbox"/> |

2a. Please comment on your answer, especially in relation to the international context (harmonization with international laws, etc.).

3. In most cases could/can you trust your ministerial officials to provide reliable and intelligent information?

This indicator is to capture the nature of the work of ministerial officials and the extent to which ministers use their ministerial officials for political advice.

- (1) Yes, mostly
- (2) Yes, sometimes
- (3) Rarely
- (4) No, not at all

3a. Does this also apply to political advice? (Open answer)

4. If you needed external advice, whom would you prefer to rely on, or have you relied on, to get the information you need?

- (1) Political advisors
- (2) Political Parties
- (3) Academic specialists
- (4) NGO specialists
- (5) Others: (specify)

4a. To what extent are external advisors used in the policymaking process?

- (1) Always
- (2) Often
- (3) Sometimes, concerning important issues
- (4) Rarely

4b. Please provide examples (when and in which cases did your ministry use external advisors, and if so, who were the advisors?)

5. Concerning ministries, would you say that the quality of civil servants has improved or declined since 1991 regarding ability to provide advice?

By quality we refer to education, but also to independent problem solving ability, attitude to responsibility and efficiency.

- (1) Significant improvement
- (2) Some Improvement
- (3) No change
- (4) Declined

5a. Interviewer: If the respondent did not mark "declined", proceed to question 6a.

6. If declined, what are the main reasons?

- (1) They are not qualified to handle new tasks
- (2) They have second jobs for economic reasons
- (3) The best have left for jobs in the private sector
- (4) The best have left for jobs in international organizations or are working abroad
- (5) They are not motivated to perform a good job
- (6) Other:

6a. If you think that the quality of civil servants has improved or did not change, please explain why?

7. In your own ministry, is/was it common practice that ministerial officials have close working relationships with significant organizations (business, NGO, or state) within the field of the ministry?

- (1) Yes :
- (2) No :

7a. If "yes" or "no", why?

8. Is/was this a common practice in other ministries?

- (1) Yes :
- (2) No :
- Do not know :

12. Ministerial officials should advise:

- On technical matters? (1) Agree (2) Disagree
- On political strategy? (1) Agree (2) Disagree

13. In your opinion, it is better if the ministers themselves can appoint their officials?

Interviewer: pause before you mention the last category

(1) Strongly agree	(2) Agree	(3) Disagree	(4) Strongly disagree	(5) Do not know
<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

14. In your opinion should officials in one ministry be allowed to provide information to other ministries or departments without prior permission?

Interviewer: pause before you mention the last category

(1) Strongly agree	(2) Agree	(3) Disagree	(4) Strongly disagree	(5) Do not know
<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

14a. Interviewer. If the respondent disagreed or did not know, proceed to question 16.

15. If you agree, was/is this a common occurrence between yours and other ministries?

- (1) Yes :
- (2) No :

The influence of outside actors

16. Name the three most influential domestic political players (organizations and/or persons) in Kyrgyzstan before and after 1991 (for example: representatives of the legislature, executive power field, political parties, “Grey Cardinals”, private business etc.).

Interviewer: When writing surname (and post), pay special attention to the peak of career or popularity of the named persons.

Before 1991:

After 1991:

(1)

(1)

(2)

(2)

(3)

(3)

17. Name the three most influential political actors in your field of responsibility as minister after independence (reflect upon current or latest ministerial post).

Interviewer: When writing surname (and post), pay special attention to the peak of career or popularity of the named persons.

(1)

(2)

(3)

18. Which ministry or presidential department do you consider to be the core ministry or department in terms of influence on decision-making in other ministries and/or departments?

19. If other ministries or presidential departments tried/try to influence proposals in your own ministry, causing you to lose competence or resources, how would you perceive it?

(1) Generally acceptable :

(2) Generally not acceptable :

20. In cases where other ministries, departments or parliamentary committees tried to influence proposals in your own ministry, who did it most frequently?

- (1) Which ministry? _____
- (2) Which department? _____
- (3) Which parliamentary committee? _____
- (4) Other? _____

21. From your point of view, when other ministries, departments or political circles interfered in your business, could it be that a third party outside the realm of politics has interfered in the decision-making?

- (1) Agree : _____ If you agree, give an example of who this third party may be:
- (2) Disagree :
- (3) Do not know :

22. During your time in government, did foreign actors (governments, international organizations) try to influence policy and regulations in your ministry?

- (1) Yes :
- (2) No :

22a. Interviewer: if the respondent answered "no", proceed to question 23.

22b. Name the three most important international actors.

- (1) _____
- (2) _____
- (3) _____

23. In general, in cases when foreign actors did have influence, would you say that their influence on the decisions to be made had a positive or negative effect on the solutions of domestic problems?

	(1) Always	(2) Most cases	(3) Rarely	(4) Never
(A) Positive effect	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
(B) Negative effect	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
(C) No effect	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

23a. If possible, please comment:

24. Have you ever felt under pressure from outside actors (non-state organizations, peak level business, etc.) to initiate new legislation?

(1) Often	<input type="checkbox"/>
(2) Often, but not concerning really important issues	<input type="checkbox"/>
(3) Sometimes	<input type="checkbox"/>
(4) Rarely	<input type="checkbox"/>
(5) Never	<input type="checkbox"/>

Interviewer: *if 1-3 proceed to question 25,*

if 4-5 proceed to question 26

25. If often, did you feel that this pressure was positive or negative for the country?

(1) Always Positive	(2) Mostly Positive	(3) 50/50	(4) Mostly Negative	(4) Always Negative
<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

25a. If possible, please comment on your answer (from the perspective of society, economy, government, international position etc.).

26. Do the civil servants in your ministry have close working relationships with major interest organizations within the ministry's resort?

"Working relationship" understood as cases in which organizations are invited to comment on policy proposals or when they assist by contributing information on the specific policy area in question.

- (1) Yes, most of the time :
- (2) Yes, but only concerning important issues :
- (3) No :

27. Concerning lobbying, that is, when outside interests attempt to influence the political process, would you in most cases agree or disagree with the following statements?

- | | (1) Agree | (2) Disagree |
|--|--------------------------|--------------------------|
| (A) Lobbying is positive because it provides the information you need to make the right decision | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| (B) Lobbying is negative because the information you receive is biased | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| (C) Lobbying is positive because you get support from the concerned groupings | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| (D) Lobbying is negative because it erodes the impartiality of the ministry | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |

27a. If possible, please comment on your answer and provide examples of negative or positive lobbying:

28. Do you believe that decisions are improved when concerned interests are incorporated or heard in the process of formulation?

- (1) Yes, mostly
- (2) Yes, sometimes
- (3) No, only rarely
- (4) No, worse

Comments:

28a. In which form is/was the concerned interests incorporated or consulted in the process of formulation?

- (1) We have an Institutional forum for discussion and co-operation.
- (2) Institutional forums are formed on an ad hoc basis.
- (3) There can be informal forums depending on the character of the case.

Decision-making process

29. Try to rank the most important formal decision-makers affecting decisions in your ministry: for example, yourself, the President, the Prime Minister, minister, vice ministers, formal ministerial advisers, administrative advisers, departmental directors, chairmen of parliamentary committees, individual members of parliament.

The list contains only suggestions. The respondent should be encouraged to reflect upon his/her own experience.

- (1) _____
- (2) _____
- (3) _____
- (4) _____
- (5) _____
- (6) _____

30. Try to rank the following fora with regard to decision-making of relevance for your ministry: the President, the cabinet, the council of ministers, cabinet committees, parliamentary committees, courts.

- (1) _____
- (2) _____
- (3) _____
- (4) _____
- (5) _____
- (6) _____

31. Name the most important informal decision-making forum affecting your ministry.

36. Based on your experience, what are the three most important issues that complicate decision-making?

(1) _____

(2) _____

(3) _____

37. If solutions to problems are not applicable due to current legislation, what do you believe to have been the general response in various ministries?

- (1) To solve the problems by administrative measures, regardless of current legislation
- (2) To solve the problem by administrative measures, and at the same time initiate revision of the relevant legislation
- (3) To initiate a change of legislation before addressing the problem
- (4) Other. Please comment:

Implementation

38. Were you generally confident that decisions made in your ministry would be implemented as intended by your staff?

(1) Yes :

(2) No :

38a. Please indicate whether situations often arise, that make it necessary to control the work of your ministerial staff so as to ensure that decisions are implemented in accordance with the political intentions?

- (1) Yes, often
- (2) Seldom
- (3) Practically never

39. Some people claim that there are many obstacles to implementing a policy effectively and efficiently. I am now going to read out some of these obstacles. Please specify whether you have experienced these in your ministry:

- (1) Inadequate resources (time and finances)
- (2) Lack of understanding and agreement on objectives by the involved officials
- (3) Poor policy design (no or inappropriate relation between cause and effect)
- (4) Lack of co-ordination and information
- (5) Lack of monitoring and evaluation activity on decision-making process and implementation
- (6) Tasks were insufficiently specified
- (7) Outside interference in the program (please specify)
- (8) Staff insufficiently motivated

39a. If possible, please, provide other examples (open answer).

39b. Some people claim that regional interests are a major obstacle to implementing policy effectively and efficiently – what is your opinion?

- (1) Agree
- (2) Disagree

Please, elaborate:

40. In cases where either the implementation or a policy-program faced difficulties, did you or the management of your ministry take the political responsibility?

- (1) Yes
- (2) No

41. To what extent do you agree with the following proposition?

To ensure compliance in the process of implementation, it is better when organizations, private business or other concerned interests assist in formulating the implementation design.

(1) Strongly agree	(2) Agree	(3) Disagree	(4) Strongly disagree	(5) Do not know
<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

41a. If you strongly agree or agree, please provide examples:

41b. If you disagree, please explain why:

42. To what extent do you agree with the following proposition?

Powerful non-state actors (companies and individuals) can escape regulatory measures.

Please evaluate the above statement in the case of the following actors:

a) individuals

(1) Strongly agree	(2) Agree	(3) Disagree	(4) Strongly disagree	(5) Do not know
<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

b) interest organizations

(1) Strongly agree	(2) Agree	(3) Disagree	(4) Strongly disagree	(5) Do not know
<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

c) business actors

(1) Strongly agree	(2) Agree	(3) Disagree	(4) Strongly disagree	(5) Do not know
<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

d) other; please specify

The attitude and role of the public

45. What role should the public primarily play in politics and government?

(Only one mark)

(1) The public should elect representatives and let them run the country.

(2) The public should take an interest in politics and communicate their views to the representatives.

(3) The public should become actively engaged in parties, associations, local government, etc. in order to gain greater influence on politics.

46. During your time as minister, did you experience attempts to bribe you into favoring specific groups or individuals?

(1) Often

(2) Sometimes

(3) A few times

(4) Never

(5) No answer

46a. During your time as minister, have you heard of such attempts in other ministries?

(1) Yes

(2) No

47. During your time as minister, did you receive threats from non-state actors (peak level business, interest groups, etc.)?

(1) Often

(2) Sometimes

(3) A few times

(4) Never

(5) No answer

Interviewer: if the respondent answered “never” or “no answer”, proceed to question 48.

47a. If you did receive threats, then in which cases? (Give examples)

47b. If you did receive threats, please specify which type:

- (1) Threats from party donors to cut finances
- (2) Political sanctions
- (3) Other, please specify

48. If such pressure was applied in any ministry, did it, in your opinion, affect decisions or implementation?

(Open answer)

49. Do you agree that misuse of status positions is common in Kyrgyzstani politics?

(pause before you mention the last category)

(1) Strongly agree	(2) Agree	(3) Disagree	(4) Strongly disagree	(5) Do not know
<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

50. At which level of government do you think that the phenomenon of misuse is most common?

Interviewer: Multiple marks allowed

- (1) Top level
- (2) Ministers
- (3) Intermediate level
- (4) Lower level officials
- (5) Parliament
- (6) Do not know

51. During your time as minister, did you obtain any knowledge about persons engaged in irregular activities on the governmental level?

This question tries to establish a picture of the prevalence of this phenomenon.

- (1) Yes, in my own ministry
- (2) Yes, in other ministries
- (3) No, but I assume so
- (4) No, not at all

Your comments:

52. In your opinion, are current laws sufficient for combating corruption?

(Open answer)

52a. In your opinion, are the law-enforcement agencies effective in the battle against corruption?

- (1) Yes
- (2) Yes, more or less
- (3) Yes and No
- (4) Rather not
- (5) No

53. In your opinion, what are the main cause(s) of corruption in the state administration?

(please rank these options, if possible)

- (1) Salaries too low
- (2) Low moral quality of civil servants
- (3) Legacy of the soviet system
(nomenclature networking)
- (4) Illegal organizations (Mafia)
- (5) Other: please comment.

53a. From your point of view, do clan-structures have any influence on the level of corruption in the Republic of Kyrgyzstan?

- (1) The clan structures pave the way for corruption.
- (2) The clan structures do not have any significant influence on the level of corruption in the country.

54. Which other country in the world do you think Kyrgyzstan resembles most?

Now: _____ **In 10 years:** _____

Why?

Background Questions

55. Have you ever been elected to a political post (parliament member, local government), please specify.

56. Were/are you a party member while being minister? - If so, which party.

57. What was/is your position in this party?

58. What was your occupation before 1991?

60. If Kyrgyzstani resident before 1991:

Were you member of a party?

- (1) Yes, the Communist Party
- (2) Yes, the Young Communist League
- (3) Yes, other party/movement
Which one _____
- (4) Non-member

61. What is your education?

- (1) Primary
- (2) Secondary
- (3) Secondary, special
- (4) University (please specify below)
- (5) Bachelor
- (6) Master
- (7) Ph.D.
- (8) Doctoral
- (9) Academic position

62. In which field were you educated?

63. Have you supplemented your education after 1991?

Yes:

No:

If yes, then which type?

64. Where were you educated, before and after 1991?

- | Before 1991 | | After 1991 | |
|-----------------------------|--------------------------|--------------------------------------|--------------------------|
| (1) Kyrgyzstan | <input type="checkbox"/> | (1) Kyrgyzstan | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| (2) Other communist country | <input type="checkbox"/> | (2) Other previous communist country | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| (3) Western Europe | <input type="checkbox"/> | (3) Western Europe | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| (4) USA | <input type="checkbox"/> | (4) USA | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| (5) Other: (specify) | <input type="checkbox"/> | (5) Other: (specify) | <input type="checkbox"/> |
- _____

65. What is your age? _____ **(years)**

65a. Sex: 1. Male () 2. Female ()

66. What is your marital status?

67. What is your ethnic background?

68. If married, what is the ethnic background of your spouse?

69. In which country (republic) were you born?

69a. Please, indicate where you were born (county, city, region).

69b. In what language do you mainly speak:

At home

- (1) Kyrgyz
- (2) Russian

At work

- (1) Kyrgyz
- (2) Russian

Interviewers' remarks

70. Has the respondent been charged with or sentenced in matters of corruption during his/her time in ministry?

71. Did you generally consider his/her answers reliable?

72. If not, which answers in particular do you think were unreliable? (Please refer to the number of the question).

73. Which questions did you perceive to be the most difficult for the respondent to understand? (Please refer to the number of the question).

74. Did you feel that some of the questions went too far terms of violating the discretion of the respondent? (If yes, please specify).
